

Criteria for the Appraisal of Academic Articles for the *HIKMA – Journal of Islamic Theology and Religious Education*

In order to ensure the comparability of reviews written by different people, the editorial team of the HIKMA has decided to provide reviewers with a set of general guidelines. Please make use of and be guided by these criteria when appraising articles. Any views and opinions on other aspects of the article(s) being reviewed are of course also highly welcome.

1. How important is the issue examined in the article for the field of Islamic Religious Education and/or Islamic Theology?
 - Which specific sub-disciplines of religious education or theology are addressed in the article?
 - Is the subject a current one?
2. Which theoretical approach is taken towards examining the subject at hand? Is the selected approach an adequate one, and does the article contribute to the prevailing discussion in the academic field?
 - Does the text answer the research question?
 - Does the article provide new knowledge and/or broaden the field of knowledge on the subject area under consideration?
 - Does the text consider the differing views and perspectives on the issue prevalent in the scientific community at large?
 - Does the author name and consider both the strengths *and* the weaknesses of different aspects of his/her article (i.e. the argumentation, the methodology, the theoretical approach etc.)?
3. Does the text make direct reference to the research question? Is the analytical methodology employed in the text appropriate?
 - As regards qualitative and quantitative studies: Does the text observe the empirical standards?
 - As regards peer reviews of the study: How has the scientific community reacted to the study (i.e. in terms of its strengths and weaknesses)?
4. Does the author present his/her arguments in a clear way and is the text written in a coherent fashion? Can the conclusions be logically extracted from the content of the text?
 - Is a common thread discernible in the text?
 - Is the text structured in a comprehensible and understandable fashion? Are the different sections of the text connected with each other in a logical fashion?
5. Is the literature cited in the text relevant to the subject under examination? Is the balance between older and more recent literature an adequate one?
 - The balance between older and newer literature in the text
 - Is just German language literature cited in the text or is international literature also considered?
6. Is the style of writing acceptable? To what extent does the article need to be rewritten?
 - Is the content of the text easily understandable or is it presented in an unnecessarily complicated fashion?
 - To what extent might a simplification be possible without compromising the article's content?